

21 February 2025

**James Wallwork
One Planet Development Ltd**

23965/AKC

Dear James,

RE: Land adjacent to the A614, Worksop – heritage addendum

This heritage addendum has been produced in response to the consultee comments received by Bassetlaw District Council with regard to a planning application for land adjacent to the A614 (Planning Ref: 24/00384/FUL). Consultee responses under consideration here comprise those from:

- Sara Willhoit, Landscape Architect, Historic England correspondence dated 2nd May 2024 and 8th October 2024;
- Jamie Wignall, Conservation Officer, Bassetlaw District Council correspondence dated 9th May 2024, 3rd December 2024, and 17th January 2024;
- Ruth Haigh, Assistant Planning Advisor and Andrew Grayson, Planning Advisor, National Trust correspondence dated 20th May 2024 and 4th December 2024
- Alison Allighan, Conservation Casework Manager and Acting Conservation officer, The Gardens Trust correspondence dated 21st January 2025; and
- Honor Whitfield, Planner and Oliver Scott, Business Manager, Newark and Sherwood District Council correspondence dated 30th April 2024 and 10th January 2025.

The consultees listed above have raised concerns over a number of different designated heritage assets within the vicinity of the Site although it is noted that the Conservation Officer is the only consultee to object to the proposed development.

Conservation Officer

The Conservation Officer for Bassetlaw District Council has raised concerns to the scheme. These concerns are articulated in three correspondence responses. The Conservation Officer has also attended a site visit with the applicant and myself as their heritage advisor. The correspondence reflects the changes to the design that have occurred in response to the Conservation Officer's concerns. It should

be noted that the Conservation Officer has moved from a position of substantial harm to one of less than substantial harm. The below addresses the latest consultee response.

The Conservation Officer's response states that the proposed development would result in less than substantial harm to the following designated heritage assets:

- Clumber Park, Grade I Registered Park and Garden (NHLE: 1001079);
- Drayton Gate, Grade II* Listed Building (NHLE: 1045058, forming part of Clumber Park);
- Gate Piers And Flanking Walls To Normanton Gate, Grade II* Listed Building (NHLE: 1156026, forming part of Clumber Park);
- West Bridge, Scheduled Monument, Grade II* and Grade II Listed Building (NHLE: 1006400, 1223918, 1370411, adjacent to Clumber Park); and
- Thoresby Park, Grade I Registered Park and Garden (NHLE: 1000361).

The response states that the Site, "contributes resolutely to the open rural countryside setting of the heritage assets." The response continues to state that, "The setting of the grade I listed Clumber Park, as well as that of the adjacent grade I listed Thoresby Park, owe much of their setting/significance (sic) to this open and rural character." The response fails to identify what contribution that the Site specifically makes to either the significance of the heritage assets or to the ability to appreciate that significance in line with Historic England's *Historic Environment Good Practice Advice in Planning Note 3: The Setting of Heritage Assets* (GPA3; 2017).

Setting of Clumber and Thoresby

In response to the Conservation Officer's comments, I hereby outline my own assessment of the setting of the assets and the impact of the Proposed Development, following the guidance contained within GPA 3.

Clumber Park and Thoresby Park are both of high significance as Grade I registered Parks and Gardens. They represent two of the four 'Dukeries' alongside the Grade II Registered Welbeck Abbey (NHLE: 1000556) and Worksop Manor. It is the interrelationship of these four estates which allows an appreciation of the transition of the medieval forest landscape to the establishment of the great country estates by the eighteenth century. The difference in landscaping, planting, and architecture of each

provide counter points to each other and demonstrate the social competition of the eighteenth and nineteenth century aristocracy. It is considered that this aspect of the setting of the assets makes the greatest contribution to an appreciation of the heritage significance of both Clumber Park and Thoresby Park. It should be noted that the setting of Thoresby Park itself will not be affected, it is the impact on the relationship of the two parks and the understanding of this relationship within the wider landscape which the Conservation Officer has raised as an issue.

The land to the east of Clumber Park, within which the Site lies, comprises a modern agricultural landscape interspersed with areas of plantation woodland. The eastern portion of Clumber Park has an inward facing character where the rolling landscape allows for an appreciation of the Listed Buildings located within Hardwick Village. The eastern boundary of the park is predominately screened by mature planting, which is evident on John Chapman's map of Nottinghamshire dating to 1774, and this is further reinforced by additional planting on the east side of the A614. The result of this is that there are no significant views across the wider landscape to the east.

The most significant feature within this portion of the landscape is West Drayton Avenue which is clearly discernible within the landscape and in places survives in its original tree-lined form although in the vicinity of the Site the character of the avenue has been impacted by the planting of a modern plantation and the loss of original trees. Its course runs for approximately 6 km to the village of West Drayton on the modern A1. It is considered that this feature makes an important contribution to the setting of Clumber Park by demonstrating the historic approach to the southeast of the park, and the importance of the Great North Road as a transport route for the Dukes of Newcastle, although this was not the main entrance into the park. This would have been to the northeast of the park and is marked by the highly ornate Grade I Listed Apleyhead Lodge (NHLE: 1267083).

It should be noted that the eastern entrance to the park is currently the West Drayton Gate, but this function was originally performed by the Normanton Gate which lies to the north of the Avenue highlighting that the Avenue itself has changed alignment. The original alignment has been eroded within the landscape and the separation of the gate from the West Drayton Avenue is completed through the modern extension to the Normanton Inn which directly faces it. The alignment will be reinstated as part of the proposed development. The function of both gates as entrance points to the Park will remain and the ability to appreciate their function will be maintained. The link between the West Drayton Avenue and the West Drayton Gate will not be affected by the proposed development as the Avenue will be retained. The link between the former avenue and Normanton Gate has already been removed. The scheme will thus not impact the setting of either listed structure.

When considering the degree to which the Site contributes to the setting of Clumber Park itself, it is important to note that the current character of the Site is one of modern agricultural fields which are the result of agglomeration during the second half of the twentieth century resulting in a considerably altered field pattern. It is not "comprised of a range of open field systems" as stated by the Conservation Officer. Successive Ordnance Survey mapping dating to the nineteenth and twentieth centuries demonstrates the removal and remodelling of hedges and field boundaries of a post-medieval field system into the modern agricultural landscape within which the Site sits. The Site, in its character and appearance, is clearly a product of modern agricultural practices.

The mature planting along both sides of the A614 means that Clumber Park is almost entirely screened from the Site. The site visit, undertaken in February 2024, noted limited seasonal visibility through portions of the planting along the western edge of the Site but such glimpsed views do not allow an appreciation of the significance of Clumber Park. It is therefore considered that, although the Site is within the setting of the Grade I Registered Clumber Park, it does not make a meaningful contribution to the heritage significance of the designated heritage asset and as such the Site makes a neutral contribution.

West Bridge (NHLE: 1006400, 1223918, 1370411) is located approximately 150 m north of the Site. It is considered that the setting of the bridge is tied to its functional and spatial relationship with the A614 and the River Poulter. The A614 is a busy road and the moving traffic and associated noise combined with the modern adaptation of the road surface all detract from an ability to appreciate the heritage significance of the bridge. Despite the proximity of the Site to the bridge, there is no intervisibility and it is considered that the Site does not contribute to the setting of the Scheduled Monument and that consequently this designated heritage assets is not a constraint to the proposed development.

Gardens Trust

The Gardens Trust have also raised concerns regarding the impact of the proposals on both Clumber Park and Thoresby Park, although they do not object to the scheme.

It is noted that the Gardens Trust were unable to visit the site to undertake their assessment. The Gardens Trust state that Google Street View imagery demonstrates permeability of the existing deciduous tree cover between Clumber and Thoresby Parks, and the Site over the winter months. This does not express the conditions on the ground,

The original site visit undertaken for the historic environment desk-based assessment was undertaken in February 2024 and therefore was able to assess the existing screening in winter. The view from the northeast corner of Thoresby Park is completely screened by the evergreen plantation of Normanton Larches and there is no visibility of the Site. The view towards the Site from the A614 from outside of Clumber Park ignores the existing planting within Clumber Park on the west side of the A614. These seasonal views do not contribute to the heritage significance of Clumber Park.

The Gardens Trust state that, "This part of north Nottinghamshire is characterised by the large, designed landscapes and estates that run contiguously through and help characterise a large part of Sherwood Forest." It is agreed that the Dukeries do characterise this area but the Site is not part of a designed landscape and, although agrarian, it has already been established that it is a modern agricultural landscape resulting from its continued use.

Historic England and National Trust

Historic England's response draws attention to the experiential aspect of moving along West Drayton Avenue. Similarly, the National Trust response highlights concerns regarding the potential risk presented to the wider setting of the Registered Park and Garden. Both focus on the historic arrival and entrance points, stressing the importance of experiential setting. Neither party objects to the scheme.

As outlined above, it is recognised that West Drayton Avenue is a significant landscape feature which makes a positive contribution to the setting of Clumber Park, the West Drayton Gate, and the Normanton Gate. As noted by Historic England, the avenue is evident on nineteenth century maps as a tree-lined avenue. It should be recognised that West Drayton Avenue is only one approach to Clumber Park and does not lead to the principal entrance to the park.

It is, as of June 2024, not possible to traverse the entire route of the avenue as it is blocked at its junction with Redhill Lane. However, if the route could be traversed, the experience would be much changed due to development during the twentieth century. This includes the former mine at West Drayton located to the south of the avenue with a remediation plantation. In closer proximity of the Site, to the west of Redhill Lane, the vast majority of the specimen trees have been removed and the avenue appears as a farm track as it enters the plantation of Normanton Larches. The experience of moving along the avenue is that of travelling through a modern agricultural landscape comprising agglomerated fields which are not historic in character and modern plantation woodland. This includes the Site.

The alignment of the Avenue remains, alongside the relationship with the West Drayton Gate. This will not be affected by the proposed development. The development has considered this importance with a significant offset from the Avenue. In addition, the development will retain existing field boundaries, thus the understanding of the agricultural landscape, albeit a modern one, will remain. Historic England have also stated that they welcome the enhancement features provided by the scheme, including the reinstatement of a hedgerow with specimen hedgerow trees along a line of the historic route between Normanton Inn and West Drayton Avenue. These enhancements would assist in reinstating previous aspects of the landscape character, improve the legibility of the historic approaches to Clumber Park, and will result in long-term benefits which will remain long after the life of the proposed temporary development.

Newark and Sherwood District Council

In the consultee response dated 30 April 2024, Newark and Sherwood District Council state that they had no observations to make. Their subsequent response dated 10 January 2025 raised concerns that the proposals would result in a degree of harm at the lower end of less than substantial to Thoresby Hall Registered Park and Garden but did not object to the planning application. For the reasons laid out above it is considered that the Site does not make a significant contribution to the setting of Thoresby Hall and that the changes brought about by the proposals would continue to allow the heritage significance of the Registered Park and Garden to be appreciated.

Conclusions

The design of the proposed scheme has sought to minimise any potential impacts to the setting of Clumber Park. The proposed scheme will be effectively screened from the Registered Park and Gardens and its associated Listed Buildings by existing planting, which will be reinforced by additional landscaping some of which deliver long-term conservation enhancements. Key views within the parkland, which allow an appreciation of the designed landscape, including the model Hardwick Village and the Listed Buildings contained therein, will be unaffected. The site visit confirmed that key views encompass views within the parkland itself, and that there are no key views across the wider landscape to the east that include the Site. It is considered that the existing tree planting on both sides of the A614 effectively screen the wider landscape from the park. The scheme proposals include provisions for additional planting which will reinforce the existing screening along the western and southern boundaries of the Site. Furthermore, the amended designs have set the solar arrays further back from the southern boundary to ensure that the agricultural character remains legible. This is confirmed by the

consultee responses with concerns focussed on the contribution that the Site makes to the agrarian setting of the assets.

It is recognised that the proposed development will result in a change within the setting of the Grade I Registered Clumber Park and the Grade II* Listed Drayton Gate and Normanton Gate. It is considered that the key aspects of the setting of these assets, namely their association with the designed landscapes of the Dukeries will remain unchanged and will continue to allow an appreciation of their heritage significance. The majority of the landscape to the east of Clumber Park will continue to be a modern agricultural landscape and the Site will continue to be legible as part of this. It is therefore considered that the proposed development will result in no harm to the setting of the Grade I Registered Clumber Park and the Grade II* Listed Drayton Gate and Normanton Gate. It is considered that the proposed development accords with the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and is compliant with the NPPF and local planning policy.

Yours sincerely,



Alex Cassels

Principal Heritage Consultant

M: 07917 086799

E: alex.cassels@cura-terrae.com